

**ECB Review comments for meeting of Nov. 4, 2021 - PRC referrals**  
**S. Hooker, 10-31-21**

**CPN-20-082** for 4519 Davidson Landing, for alterations to enlarge an existing pair of connected cottage structures (linked by a breezeway) by demolishing one, infilling between the two and adding an attached garage. Site development also includes modifications to the paved driveway, regrading and new retaining walls.

**Summary of key points:**

- ECB reviewed two earlier plans for this site in 2018, involving construction of a new garage on the southern part of the site and a minor expansion of the southernmost of the two cottages. A major concern at the time was the handling of the runoff at the southern edge of the site, where there is an existing swale and intermittent stream, sizeable during heavy storm events, running between this home and the neighbor to the south.
- The current proposal involves demolition of the southern cottage and creation of a single home with attached garage, encompassing the footprint and some features of the existing northern cottage.
- No variances are required. The new development increases the building coverage from 9.4% to 14.1%, while 15% is permitted. Lot coverage remains the same at 26.1% while 25% is permitted (no variance is needed due to a pre-existing non-conformity). Building height will remain below 25'. The increased building area is offset by a reduction in the amount of asphalt pavement; despite the increased length of the driveway, its width is narrower.
- Regrading of a steep slope to the west of the home is proposed, including construction of a retaining wall and an engineered swale to the west and south of the driveway. Runoff from the swale and the roof drains is directed to a rain garden at the east end of the swale, with overflow to the lake across a stone spillway.
- Several trees are to be removed on the east, west and south sides of the driveway to accommodate the new retaining wall and swale. A remedial landscape plan is offered to replace these with new native trees and shrubs.
- A lakeshore guidelines statement is offered describing the overall existing and proposed plantings buffering the view of the home from the lake. According to the site plan there is a single large shade tree between the two houses and the lake, which is diseased and will be removed as part of the project and replaced by a shade tree, species to be determined. Otherwise the view of the proposed home is unbroken from the lake side.

**Environmental concerns:**

- This is a challenging site to develop due to the steep slope and the amount of runoff crossing the property from uphill development. This runoff is expected to increase as a result of the DeHollander development to the west. Ontario County has been making improvements to the culverts upstream from this property in recent weeks; we suggest

the Town consult with County Public Works to ensure that we have the latest information on expected runoff rates and routes.

- The proposed retaining wall and swale, together with the downstream rain garden, appears to be a positive approach for handling the drainage issue.
- The lakefront view of this very wide house plus garage will be essentially unbuffered visually; we suggest the Town require more detail on the size and species of the proposed shade tree, and require more extensive plantings on the lake side of the building to soften the appearance from the lake.

**Recommendation:**

- ECB commends the applicant for doing a better job of addressing the site drainage challenges, compared to the proposals of 2018. While we would always like to see a reduction in lot coverage in cases of a pre-existing non-conformity, the applicants have done a good job of reducing the amount of asphalt pavement to offset the increased building size and remain at the same lot coverage. We suggest consideration of permeable paving to further encourage infiltration and reduce site runoff. We also suggest that the proposed planting plan between the home and the lake be enhanced with additional native trees and large shrubs to further soften the particularly wide expanse of house and garage from the lake side.