

facilitate drainage to the lake via proposed grassy swales and other green infrastructure storm water management measures elsewhere on the property. This may necessitate reconsideration of the need for an attached garage. The ECB recommends having a detached garage across the street instead of creating an attached garage on the lakeside parcel.

- Landscaping should include native trees and shrub species with more significant plantings lakeside. A revised landscaping plan is necessary.
- The ECB has previously commented on the unique characteristics of Sandy Beach with century old cottages which have been updated or replaced over time with larger structures. We have commented before that this ongoing granting of variances gives the impression the town is not serious about maintaining site development standards for this neighborhood.
- The ECB recommends a review of the noted “sump pump” for compliance to regulations.
- Shoreline Guidelines narrative required as well as renderings of intended work.
- The ECB recommends additional information on how increased roof drainage on the lakeside parcel would handled/mitigated.
- The ECB suggests the possibility of a green roof for the garage.

**Planning Board for Tuesday, March 22, 2022**

**CPN-22-011**

**Marks Engineering, c/o Brennen Marks, P.E., 42 Beeman Street, Canandaigua, N.Y. 14424; representing Quisisana Trust, 5715 Forbes Avenue, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15217; and Saralinda Hooker, 4760 S. Menteth Drive, Canandaigua, N.Y. 14424; owners of property at 4760 S. Menteth Drive.**

TM #140.11-1-36.000

Requesting a Single-Stage Site Plan approval for the tear down of an existing cottage and rebuild of a new cottage.

**Reviewer:** ECB Board

**Summary of Key Points:**

- Ms. Hooker shared information about the property.
  - It is at the tip of Menteth Point and next to the mouth of Menteth Creek. The creek has the largest watershed for the lake and this is a flood prone area.
  - Property has been in Ms. Hooker’s family for 100 years and over that time, the number of cottages on the property has increased. With the first of these additional structures was built in 1938. This was the “Little House” which is a rustic, “bunk house.” Another house was also built in 1948. In the mid-1960’s the original house burned down and was replaced with another house in 1968.

- The property is used only by Ms. Hooker's family and it is seasonal use only.
- The Little House has no heat, no insulation, and no bathtub/shower. Project will demolish the Little House and rebuild on same site (after the 2022 summer season).
- The existing building is 30' from Menteth Creek. This is a pre-existing nonconformity in stream setback.
- The new structure will occupy mostly the same footprint. The Little House has 500 sq. ft footprint building plus a screened in porch for a total of 625 sq. ft. The new house will be on the same creek setback. New structure will be 775 sq. ft. plus screened porch of 125 sq ft. The existing structure is one story and the new one will be 1.5 stories. The existing house has two bedrooms and the new one will have three. The septic system will be increased. Septic is from 2012 and has leach field by West Lake Road.
- New house is capable of year-round use but seasonal use by family members is still planned. Ms. Hooker noted possible more three-season use and the potential for winter use.
- This house is in the flood plain and regulations require the first floor to be 2' above the flood plain. Current first floor is at the flood plain level. The new house will have significant elevation required and they use fill to gradually create a platform for the new house. This area will landscaped as a rock garden with native shrubs. The new house will have a full foundation and Ms. Hooker noted the possibility of a crawl space.
- The property has flooded repeatedly over the 100 years. Flooded in 1933 (Great Flood of 1933) and Hurricane Agnes (1972). This house's floor was under water during Hurricane Agnes. Flooding in 1994 (full lake event) but that event didn't flood the Little House. Menteth Creek flooding is more of an issue than the lake floods.
- The applicant is working with Marks Engineering to direct flood waters from Menteth Creek to minimize damage. They are intending to channel water around the houses and to the lake with an over-sized, gravel-filled French drain through the grassy area. Covering the drain with sod is planned.
- They plan on maintaining a strong stream buffer—natural berm creating by logs and material carried along the creek.
- Comment by Chris Jensen: there should be a hard surface parking space for every building. They have always parked on the grass. There is no current paving on the property and there is only a gravel driveway. If possible, they would ask for an exception to the hard parking surface requirement.

- The parcel is eight acres, 200' of lake frontage.

**Environmental Concerns:**

- Menteth Creek setback of 30'
- Menteth Creek is a trout spawning area and smelt have returned to the creek
- Intermittent flooding of parcel
- Parcel has numerous mature trees

**Additional Comments from the ECB Meeting:**

- Regarding hard parking surface: Ms. Bonshak asked if grass pavers were a possibility. Mr. Kochersberger questioned how they would hold up for an area that intermittently floods. Ms. Hooker noted their expense and that if there was a desire to use this property in the winter that there would be additional access issues and they would make changes at that point. Ms. Venezia commented that the ECB is a proponent of less coverage.
- Ms. Bonshak noted the pre-existing nonconformity of multiple dwelling units per one parcel.
- Mr. Kochersberger asked if there are trout in the stream and Ms. Hooker answered it is a trout spawning area and added that it was an active smelt location until zebra mussels were introduced. She noted that smelt have returned.
- Mr. Damann asked if the driveway was considered as a dual-use infiltration point. Ms. Hooker answered that the driveway is too compacted to provide much infiltration and is the principal path of flood waters. Mr. Damann also noted that the French drain trench will need to be placed to miss existing tree roots. Ms. Hooker notes that actual path of the drain may be modified to avoid tree root systems.
- Mr. Damann asked if maintenance is required on the leach field to keep tree roots out to maintain functionality. Ms. Hooker will ask the engineer about that. Ms. Hooker noted a basswood and walnut tree that have root systems that will be impacted by construction. Ms. Hooker said that they will shift work to minimize damage to the trees' root systems.

**Recommendations:**

- Because of proximity to the lake and creek, the ECB recommends allowing porous grass parking surfaces—as long as the home use remains seasonal.
- The ECB recommends avoiding tree root systems when installing the French drain.
- The ECB recommends following up with the engineer to ensure proper functioning of the leach field with regards to tree roots.